

# **Palestinians and Jews Living Together: A Case Study in Nazareth Elit**

**Naomi Carmon**

**Hana Hamdan**

**Center for Urban and Regional Studies  
Technion – Israel Institute of Technology**

**ACSP-AESOP Joint Congress, Leuven, July 2003**

# Background Data

- In Israel (without the West Bank and Gaza)  
6.5 million citizens:  
80% Jews and most of the others Arabs
- Arab citizens in Israel
  - \* 80% Muslims, 12% Christians, 8% Druze
  - \* ~80% live in Arab towns and villages
  - \* ~15% in a few old mixed cities  
(Jerusalem, Haifa, Acre)
  - \* Others - scattered

# Nazareth Elit

- Established as a Development Town in 1956, part of a governmental policy to disperse the Jewish population throughout the country
- Located next to the old city of Nazareth populated only by Arabs
- Nowadays, a town of 45,000 residents, about 40% of them immigrated in the last decade from former USSR, about 10% are Arabs

# Nazareth Elit

## Empirical Study

- Only Arabs were studied
- 200 interviews with heads of households in Arabic by an Arab student
- 80 interviews in a mostly Arab neighborhood (the only one in town)
- 120 interviews in the other neighborhoods in which Arabs are a small minority
- Conducted early 2000 (before October 2000)

# Study Questions

- Migration of Arabs into Nazareth Elit and its causes
- Behavior of Arabs in Nathareth Elit
  - \* Housing segregation/integration
  - \* Use of services
- Attitudes of Arabs in Nathareth Elit
  - \* Towards their Neighbors
  - \* Towards the city and the neighborhood

# Findings

# Arabs in Nazareth Elit

Year	Total Population	Arabs (number)	Arabs (%)
1961	4,300	0	0
1972	15,000	600	4.0
1983	23,600	2,400	10.2
1995	37,700	3,000	7.9
2000	44,400	3,800	8.6

# **Interviewees' characteristics:**

## **Religion**

- **77% Christians, 23% Muslims**
- **Observance (by personal evidence):**
  - **69% - no**
  - **28% - in-between**
  - **3% - religious**
- **Similar observance among Christians and Muslims**



# **Interviewees' characteristics:**

## **Place of origin**

- 75% migrated from Arab Nazareth**
- 15% migrated from close-by villages**
- 10% migrated from other places in Israel**

# **Interviewees' characteristics:**

## **Time in town**

**Up to 5 years      24%**

**6-20 years      43%**

**21-40 years      28%**

**40+ years      6%**

# Interviewees' characteristics:

## Education (15+, %)

Years in school	Interv. in Nazareth Elit	Total in Nazareth Elit	Total in Arab Nazareth	Arabs in Israel
Up to 8	8	20	31	40
9-12	60	50	54	47
13-15	20	20	10	8
+16	12	10	5	5
Total	100	100	100	100

# Causes of Migration

## Motivations to leave place of origin

- Prices in place of origin too high
- Couldn't find desirable dwelling
- Wish for more privacy

## Motivations to select Nazareth Elit

- Close to original place, work, friends
- Better housing and living environment

# Housing Conditions

## Tenure

90% Owner occupants

10% Renters

# of  
rooms

Arabs in  
Nazareth  
Elit

Arabs in  
Arab  
Nazareth

1-2

11%

29%

3-4

60%

73%

5+

28%

8%

# **Discrimination in housing selection**

**92% said that they did not feel any  
discrimination when they were  
searching for a place to live in  
Nazareth Elit**

# Spatial Segregation/Integration

2 Patterns, both Stable

One neighborhood (haKramim)  
Voluntarily segregated

All other neighborhoods – integrated:  
A few Arab households among  
A majority of Jewish households

# **Location of Services the Interviewees' Use**

- **Elementary and high school**  
**90% in Arab Nazareth**
- **Medical, cultural and commercial services**  
**50-70% in Arab Nazareth**
- **Kindergarten, sport, cinema**  
**70-90% in Nazareth Elit**



# Relationships with Jews in the City

- **Have Jewish friends** 70%  
(one - 13% ;a few - 20 %; many - 37%)
- **Children play with Jewish neighbors** 45%
- **Children play with Arab neighbors** 66%

# Attitudes Regarding Spatial Integration

## Support integration

- At the building level 81%
- At the neighborhood level 82%
- At the city level 78%

# Plans for Future Housing

- Live in NE permanently 75%
- Live in NE for several years 20%
- Live in NE temporarily 5%

# Conclusions

# Conclusions

**(a)** Most of the Arab residents of NE moved there in search of good housing in a good environment and they are satisfied with what they found:

- 74% satisfied with their apartment
- 78% satisfied with their neighborhood
- 81% satisfied with the city and see it as their permanent place of living

Hence, we expect Arab migration into NE to continue, in spite of the conflict between Palestinians and Jews in Israel

# Conclusions

- (b) From the point of view of Arabs in NE, the space of Nazareth Elit and Arab Nazareth functions as **one urban space**
  - They live in the Hebrew side where they use baby clinics and go to cinema
  - They send their children to schools in the Arab side
  - They receive cultural and commercial services on both sides

# Conclusions

- (c) Spatial integration in Nazareth Elit has been stable for decades**
- (d) The Arabs in Nazareth Elit are interested in spatial integration and supports its existence**

# Issues for Discussion



# Issues for Discussion

## (a) Regarding Nazareth Elit

- How can we explain the good relationships between Arab and Jews in the city and the positive attitudes of most of the interviewees?
- How can we explain the stable spatial integration?

# Issues for Discussion

## **(b) Regarding internal migration of Arabs in the State of Israel**

- **Assuming moderation of the conflict between Arabs and Jews in Israel, will Arabs in large numbers migrate into Jewish towns and cities?**

# Issues for Discussion

## **(c) Regarding Arab-Jews relationships in Israel**

- **Is it reasonable to generalize from the attitudes and behavior found in Nazareth Elit about other mixed communities in Israel?**

**Thank you**